

Ardrey Kell School Media Advisory Committee Objection Decision Meeting

Members Present: Maribeth Brown, Drew Tonissen, Michelle Starnes, Shari Brady, Dalton, Mallonee, Amanda Jones, Tricia Titus, McKinley Campbell, Hannah Carpenter, Katherine Tavener, Stephen Hairgrove, Elizabeth Warshauer, Tomica Wright, Jamie Brooks, Julie Isgrigg, [REDACTED]

Student Education Record

Student Education Record

Kim Ray and Anne Bucci - Digital Learning & Library Services Team (observers), Jamie Brooks (observer)

Date: September 25, 2023

Objective: To review, discuss concerns vs. merits, and make a decision about removal or retention of books in objections submitted by parent/guardian to five library media book (below):

- *Sold* by Patricia McCormick
- *Tricks* by Ellen Hopkins
- *Jack of Hearts (and Other Parts)* by L.C. Rosen
- *A Court of Frost and Starlight* by Sarah Maas
- *19 Minutes* by Jodi Picoult

Meeting Agenda/Notes:

- Meeting initiated at 10:10 am
- Introductions
- Review of process:
 - Meeting norms
 - Review of CMS Board/Regulation A-ILM/R: objection process, timeline, selection criteria, definition of ban, reasons why challenges/objections occur, requirement for “special consideration” in selection of specific topics
 - Guidance/protocols for discussion: consensus, ensuring all voices heard and have opportunity to influence team decision, weighing concerns about content against overall merit of book, etc.

Book Review/Discussion: Sold by Patricia McCormick

- Review of concerns submitted by parent/guardian
- Discussion of overall merits of book and consideration of concerns: representation (meets need in school collection), alignment with standards, consideration of awards, the trauma by protagonist is more of focus than actual descriptions of sex, relevant issue for young people, connected to standards (i.e. health, social studies), literary and educational value to book
- Decision: Team decided to retain the book in the collection and parent/guardians may use policy to restrict access for their student by request.

Book Review/Discussion: Tricks by Ellen Hopkins

- Review of concerns submitted by parent/guardian
- Discussion of overall merits of book and consideration of concerns: Acknowledgement of sexual content and difficult subject (trafficking), and concern but used more to develop the five perspectives of the trafficking experience than to glamorize, alignment with some ELA standards (i.e. perspectives), showed variety of perspectives, award winning and recommended for gr 9 and up), drug use in book also discussed and shows implications of it, value of the red flags in relationships and value for teenagers, has only circulated once is notable.
- Decision: Team decided to retain the book in the collection and parent/guardians may use policy to restrict access for their student by request.

Book Review/Discussion: *Jack of Hearts (and Other Parts)* by L.C. Rosen

- Review of concerns submitted by parent/guardian
- Discussion of overall merits of book and consideration of concerns: representation for LGBTQIA+ readers, includes underage alcohol/cigarette use, does not instruct or direct readers to have sex, recommended for gr 10 and up, award winning, only circulated once, doesn't normalize from one character's sexual experiences while rest of characters don't, advice about positive relationships and safety, unique perspective, possible comparable selection discussed but rejected, some concern about detail of sexual content, discussion of difference between assigning and selection of book, most relationships in media is heterosexual couples so increases shock value when not, safety for homosexual males perspective important for that group, themes of classism
- Decision: Team decided to retain the book in the collection and parent/guardians may use policy to restrict access for their student by request.

Book Review/Discussion: *Court of Frost and Starlight* by Sarah J. Maas

- Review of concerns submitted by parent/guardian
- Discussion of overall merits of book and consideration of concerns: Extremely popular series, all over TikTok/social media, fantasy genre, more about war and relationships than sex, entertainment value over educational value, don't necessarily have to have in library but does engage students in reading, concern about removing a book in middle of series, students might need to research content before reading, library contains books to entertain, as well as educate, discussion about appropriateness-and not- of book for school library, some students could not purchase at bookstore, some sexually explicit scenes between individuals in a healthy relationship, more content without sexual content than with, questioned concern about homophobia from objection b/c not relevant to the book, recommended for 17 and up on one review, SEL content.
- Decision: Team decided to retain the book in the collection and parent/guardians may use policy to restrict access for their student by request.

Book Review/Discussion: *19 Minutes* by Jodi McCoult

- Review of concerns submitted by parent/guardian
- Discussion of overall merits of book and consideration of concerns (summary): Has academic and SEL merit, themes in book are comparable to those in required reading (i.e. *Othello* in curriculum), heavy topic but author did research and was dealt with delicately, sexual content was an assault related to book's central message of bullying, lower lexile level needed in collection for some readers, book may be used for needed conversation starter, actual setting is a court case and not a school shooting, sexual scene is not focus of book, brings perspective and shows diverse perspectives, teaches warning signs that are relevant/cautionary tale, students are desensitized by drills, etc, so arguably not traumatic for all readers who choose book, has circulated 7 times, cover serves as a trigger warning, suicide not explicitly stated, some will want to have open dialogue with their children about this and should have access, those who don't can restrict it for their students.
- Decision: Team decided to retain the book in the collection and parent/guardians may use policy to restrict access for their student by request.

Closure:

Meeting adjourned and thanks was given for everyone's support.

Redaction Log

Reason	Page (# of occurrences)	Description
Student Education Record	1 (1)	Confidential student education record - Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act Regulations (FERPA) - 20 U.S.C. 1232g; 34 CFR Part 99